1	EAST STROUDSBURG AREA SCHOOL DISTRICT
2	BOARD OF DIRECTORS
3	
4	In Re: Section 7-780 Public Hearing
5	表 表 表
6	Transcript of proceedings held in the
7	above-captioned matter before the East Stroudsburg School
8	District Board of Directors, East Stroudsburg High School
9	South, 50 Vine Street, East Stroudsburg, PA on Friday,
10	March 2, 2012, commencing at or about 7:08 o'clock p.m.
11	; ₩ ₩
12	WILLIAM SEARFOSS, President ROBERT COOKE, Vice President
13	RONALD D. BRADLEY, Director
14	EILEEN FEATHERMAN, Director ROBERT GRESS, Director
15	ROY HORTON, Director MARJORIE JAMES, Director
16	MICHAEL MEACHEM, Director
17	SHARON LAVERDURE, Superintendent PATRICIA BADER, Business Manager THOMAS F. DIRVONAS, ESQ., Solicitor
18	THOMAS F. DIRVONAS, ESQ., SOLICITOR
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	DONNA C VENDERDINE R D D
24	DONNA G. KENDERDINE, R.P.R. P.O. BOX 509
25	STROUDSBURG, PA 18360 (570) 992-7766

1							
2		INDEX OF	WITNESSES				
3		-	.				
4	Spea	ker's Name		Page	No.		
5		rict:					
			_				
6		Thomas F. Dirvonas, Sharon Laverdure	Esq.		4 8		
7	500	Patricia Bader			9		
8	<u>Publ</u>	<pre>Public:</pre>					
9	1.	Michael Perez			12		
	2.	Tomora Ellis			14		
10	3.	Anne McHale-Power			16		
	4.	Christine Griffin			19		
11	5.	Rose Ann Whitesell			21		
	6.	Ernest J. Mahar			23		
12	7.	Scott Amori			25		
		Sean Boyer			27		
13		Christopher Brooks			29		
		Elizabeth Kirkwood			32		
14	11.	Geoff Gamble			34		
	12.	Peter Kirkwood			37		
15		Richard Berkowitz			39		
		Robert Wilson			41		
16		Susan Jorstad			43		
		Wendy Sheeran			45		
17		Steven Zimmerman			47		
	18.				49		
18	19.	Sapphire Serrano			52		
	20.	Kerrie Curtis			53		
19	21.	Carrie Panepinto			55		
	22.	Cathy Gallagher			58		
20	23.	Gerard Rozea			59		
5.4	24.	Catharine Berkowitz			61		
21	25.	Sharon Maly-Cramer			63		
22	26.	Lynn Ames			65		
22	27.	Richard Moran			68 70		
22	28.				70 71		
23	29. 30.	Oscar Woerlein Amanda Jackson			73		
24	50.	AMUNING JUCKSON			. •		
25							

1		
2	INDEX OF EXHIBITS	
3		
4	Exhibit No. & Description	Page No.
5	Board A - Notice of Public Hearing Board B - Three Letters dated 2-23-12	5 5 7
6	Board C - Agenda and Rules of Order	7
7	a =	
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

PROCEEDINGS

Monday, February 13, 2012

present.

MR. SEARFOSS: I'd like to call to order this public hearing of the East Stroudsburg Board of Education for the purpose of receiving public comment for the closure of either J.M. Hill Elementary or Smithfield Elementary.

Madam Superintendent, all board members are

Stand for the pledge of allegiance.

MR. SEARFOSS: Mr. Dirvonas?

MR. DIRVONAS: Thank you, Mr. Searfoss. At this time I'd like to go into a few details with regard to the purpose of tonight's hearing.

The hearing is being held in compliance with Section 7-780 of the Pennsylvania Public School Code, as amended, for the purpose of holding a public hearing on the possible closing of one of two public school buildings, those being either the J.M. Hill Elementary School or the Smithfield Elementary School. The school code provides, in part, that the Board of Education cannot close a school building without holding a public hearing not less than three months prior to the decision of the board concerning the closing.

At a previous special public meeting held on February 13, 2012, the Board of Education, by majority vote

of its members, authorized tonight's public hearing.

On February 15th, 2012, notice of this public hearing was published in the Pocono Record and posted at the administrative offices and the schools of the district and on the district's website. A copy of that notice has been given to the stenographer to be included as Board Exhibit A to the transcript of this hearing.

On February 23rd, 2012, the district complied with the requirements of Section 10304 of the Municipalities Planning Code by forwarding written notices of this hearing and the possible closure of one of the school buildings to the planning commissions of Smithfield Township, the Borough of East Stroudsburg, and Monroe County soliciting their comments and recommendations concerning the hearing. Copies of those notices have also been given to the stenographer to be included collectively at Board Exhibit B to the transcript of this hearing.

The purpose of this hearing is to give the administration the opportunity to present facts and statistics with respect to the educational, physical, administrative, budgetary, and fiscal matters related to the possible closing of one of the schools in question. It gives the board the opportunity to receive public comment

concerning any possible [sic] closing. As previously stated, that actual decision cannot be made for a period of three months from the conclusion of this hearing.

A stenographic record of this hearing is being made so that a transcript of the hearing can be submitted to the Department of Education, if necessary, and made available to board members for their review. In this regard, it is requested that the public avoid expressing your approval or disapproval of comments made by particular speakers so that the stenographer is able to hear and transcribe the comments of all speakers.

It should also be noted that residents and taxpayers may submit written comments to the secretary of the Board of Education for consideration by the board prior to the expiration of the three month period. We would suggest that written comments be submitted sooner rather than later to give the board the opportunity to review those comments. Any written comments submitted prior to this hearing will not be read at the hearing, but will be made available to the board and will be made part of the record. Residents and taxpayers submitting written comments should indicate their name, address, and telephone number and should sign their comments that they are submitting.

Persons who are present at the hearing but who are not speakers are requested to list their names on the

sign-in sheet so that we have accurate information regarding those in attendance.

The agenda for this hearing and rules of order for this hearing have been made available on the district's website and at the registration and sign-in table prior to the meeting. They've also be been presented to the stenographer to be included collectively as Board Exhibit C to the transcript of this hearing.

It is important for you to keep in mind the rules of order. We are here to receive public comments regarding the possible closure of a school building. This is not a question and answer or debate session. We expect that your issues of concern will be addressed to the board in a respectful manner and that the board will, in turn, consider your concerns when discussing and making a decision on any school closing.

Because of the three month waiting period, we expect that a special board meeting will be scheduled and held in early June to discuss and vote on any school closure.

Because of the anticipated number of speakers, we have assigned speaker numbers and will request that groups of 14 or 15 be seated in the front row of the center section of the auditorium when requested so that we may have an orderly progression of speakers. We will have a brief

break or recess between the seating of subsequent groups for the benefit of the stenographer and all in attendance.

Please keep in mind that the three minute time limit for each speaker will be strictly adhered to.

I would also like to mention if there's anyone who has pre-registered to speak and if they have not signed the form available at the sign-in stable, if they could please do that now before the numbers are called.

At this time I'd like to turn the hearing over to Mrs. Laverdure, the district superintendent.

MS. LAVERDURE: Thank you, Mr. Dirvonas, and I'd like to thank you all of you for coming this evening.

We in the administration and I don't want to speak for the board, but we, as administration, appreciate your concern and understand how much this impacts our community. It's a very serious matter we're here to discuss tonight and, so, let's move on to the topic at hand.

We will be showing the slides above us and there they are. There's a timeline which we will be following and I would like to also say that this will be posted on our website tomorrow morning and for those who do not have access to a computer will have hard copies available at the administration center on Monday.

The timeline is there. It kind of recaps what Mr. Dirvonas just said. I guess the next most important

date of note would be Monday, March 12th, where we have a special board meeting planned.

So, why are we here this evening? Well, we're here to discuss, try to find some different ways to narrow the deficit in our budget. We do have a declining enrollment in our school district, we do have empty elementary classrooms in our district, and our school board members gave us, the administrators, direction to look at closing the smallest elementary schools. They said look at, gather the information. The smallest elementary schools we have in the district are J.M. Hill Elementary and Smithfield Elementary.

The next slide shows you the capacities for our elementary schools district wide. Let's go down to J.M. Hill. Projected enrollment for J.M. Hill next year will be 400 with a capacity of 484 and Smithfield's projected enrollment is 339 with a capacity of 638 students.

So, looking at that information, it is the administration's recommendation to consider only one building closure and the two scenarios that we have put together are closing Smithfield Elementary or closing J.M. Hill Elementary and I'd like to turn the rest of the presentation over to Mrs. Bader, our business manager.

MS. BADER: Thank you, Mrs. Laverdure. In Scenario No. 1, closing Smithfield, we would consider moving

the 337 students that we currently have located at Smithfield in the following way. We would move 57 students to J.M. Hill Elementary where the average class size will become 22 students. We would move 40 students to East Stroudsburg Elementary where the average class size will become 23 students. We will move 240 students to Middle Smithfield Elementary where the average class size will be 24.

We would be able to reduce personnel because of duplication of services to approximately 1.57 million dollars. We would have a furloughing of 14 professional staff and 13.5 support staff.

The operating saving reduction is approximately \$50,600.00. Additional savings could be realized if the building is mothballed and by that I mean there would be a reduction in operating costs like electricity. If the building were leased the operating expenses would remain the same, but a monthly lease income item would be reported in our revenues.

On the next slide is Scenario No. 2 which is closing the J.M. Hill School where we have considered moving 388 students. 131 of those students would move to East Stroudsburg Elementary where the average class size would become 23, 257 students to Smithfield Elementary where the average class size would be 22. However, I need to make

note that this would push both of those buildings to their maximum student capacity.

The personnel savings would be approximately \$1,012,800.00 and we would be furloughing six professionals and 13.5 support staff.

There would be an operating savings of \$50,000.00. However, the same condition would apply. If we were to mothball the building there would be savings like in natural gas and electricity and if we lease the building we would have a revenue item for the monthly lease income.

The next slide is additional considerations.

Operating expenditures would need further analysis because reductions could be realized.

We would need to budget an additional cost for moving the staff, their supplies, and also assets like things in the kitchen as well as securing the unoccupied buildings.

Then, if leased, the revenue item would be added to narrow the operating deficit.

Debt service payments would remain the same for all buildings regardless of occupancy. We currently have an 18 million dollar debt service per year.

There will be a reduction in rental state subsidy when a building is closed. We're still waiting for that information from PDE, the Pennsylvania Department of

However, we currently have 1.6 million in rental state 1 Ed. 2 subsidy for all building debt. And, that concludes the presentation. 3 MR. SEARFOSS: Mr. Dirvonas? 4 MR. DIRVONAS: Thank you, Mrs. Laverdure and 5 Mrs. Bader. 6 At this time I would like to remind those who 7 are going to speak that when it's your turn at the 8 microphone to approach the podium, state your name, address, 9 and your status within the school district; that is, are you 10 a resident, are you a taxpayer, are you both, and once we 11 12 have that information then the three minute time limit will 13 start. At this time I would like to ask Speakers 1 14 through 15 if you would proceed to the first row here and 15 we'll start with No. 1 and then fill in the row, please. 16 17 It looks as though there is no No. 2, so if we can go from 18 1 to 3 everybody should fit. Okay. If we can start with Speaker No. 1 and 19 if you would please come to the podium, state your name, 20 21 address, and status. MR. PEREZ: Thank you. My name is Michael 22 23 Perez. I'm a taxpayer and a resident. I live at 107 Lilac

Drive in East Stroudsburg, Pennsylvania.

I would like my comments to be made public

24

25

about the possible closing of Smithfield Elementary School. Smithfield Elementary School was renovated less than five years ago at the tune -- I could not find the exact amount when I tried to do my research in the last couple of weeks calling different offices within the district, but I know it was to the tune of millions of dollars and now just a few short years later we're discussing the possible closing of the school that we in this auditorium and taxpayers on the board have spent millions of dollars on renovations.

Smithfield Elementary has a full, functional kitchen which J.M. Hill does not. Smithfield Elementary has a fully functional gymnasium with a stage.

As reported in the Pocono Record as of last week, this board has decided to possibly borrow millions of dollars on upgrades and renovations to J.M. Hill Elementary School and, as a taxpayer, I do not understand that. I do not understand how we are borrowing money when we are -- have a deficit of over 10 million dollars, money that we will have to pay later on on a building that we're talking about possibly closing, for renovation and upgrades. I find that to be irresponsible by this board, to approve such as action, to borrow money when we don't have any money.

What is our long-range plan for our financial difficulties within this district? Do we all -- are we all naive to think that this ends this year? Are we naive to

think that there will not be another budget deficit next year? What are our long-term plans because, clearly, the trend in this county -- using Pocono Mountain as an example, they had a large budget deficit last year. They have an even larger budget deficit this year. So, where is this board -- where do these individuals stand on our long-range plan because if we don't have a long-range plan all of us will be standing right here one year from today to discuss possibly more closures, to discuss even higher tax increases. Our taxes increase every single year. That is a guarantee within this district. And, this year we are facing an even higher tax increase.

Please look at the long-range plans. Please consider all options because closing one building is not going to fix our problems. It is putting a Band-Aid on a wound that requires larger than a Band-Aid.

Thank you for your time.

MS. ELLIS: Good evening. I am Tomora Ellis, 236 Manor Drive. I'm a resident and a taxpayer of East Stroudsburg.

This meeting tonight proves for some of the parents a bad dream come true, your precious school closing, and my heart goes out to you. My feelings would be the same if my school were closing and since the inevitable seems to be coming true, my message is not to you, the school board,

but my message is to the parents.

I attended the public hearing last month and needed to process why some of the negative things were being said regarding the larger schools. I now understand the logic behind the comments. You are trying to save your school. However, the comments were not and are not true.

I am the proud parent of three years of one of the largest schools, ESE. ESE was recommended to me by another parent who -- my husband and I were considering private school for our first child. This parent had sent her child to a private school and ESE and declared ESE superior and now I concur.

ESE has a safe, clean, nurturing environment.

ESE teachers are always available and they respond to questions or concerns immediately. Weekly reports of the progress of the children, weekly agendas for the upcoming topics of studies, and two or three good phone calls home to the parents each and every month from every teacher are some of the things that you'll find at ESE. Monthly meetings with coffee with the principal, monthly grade level assemblies and almost weekly PTO meetings and activities and functions to help defray the cost of educational activities for the children are also thriving and found at ESE.

Reenforcing the values I teach my children at home with a positive program, positive behavior program of being a

bucket filler school is found at ESE.

Respectful, responsible, and ready to learn children, parents, staff, teachers, and my principal, Miss Livingston are all found at ESE. Fights, metal detectors, and uncared for children are not found at ESE.

I leave you with this, parents. Experience is not what happens to you, it is what you do with what happens to you, and, so, when the best things are not possible the best can be made out of those things that are available to you.

And to you, the school board, remember, a diamond is merely a lump of coal that did well under pressure. Please, just be our diamond. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: No. 4, Anne McHale Power.

MS. POWER: My name is Anne McHale Power.

I live at 301 Remington Road. I'm a resident, a taxpayer,
and a mother of two children in the district.

I'm here tonight to represent the interests of the parents, students, and faculty of Smithfield Elementary School. Just like all the other schools in the district, some of our families have been here for generations while others have been here less than a year.

Why did we stay here instead of moving away?
Why did we come here instead of settling elsewhere? Family.
These are tough times for the American dream. As the safe

routines of our lives have come undone so has our characteristic optimism; not only our beliefs that the future is full of limitless possibility, but our faith that things will eventually return to normal, whatever normal was before the recession hit. There's even worry that the dream may be over. We currently living Americans are the unfortunate ones who shall bear witness to that deflated moment in history when the promise of this country began to whither.

As taxpayers we recognize that we're facing a 10 million dollar deficit. We also recognize that closing one of these schools will not rectify that situation even when coupled with the proposed 5.8 percent tax increase. Besides tearing apart the fabric of our community what will we gain? Next year we'll find ourselves in the same situation, this time looking to close the other school and raise taxes another 5.8 percent. At that rate even families who have been here for generations will be looking to move away.

George Bernard Shaw once said, "A government that robs Peter to pay Paul can always depend on the support of Paul." I assure you that undoubtedly as J.M. Hill nor Smithfield's parents, students, and faculty want to be cast in the role of Peter, neither do we want to be cast in the role of Paul.

The ends do not justify the means. We can argue ad nauseam about which school has more history, but no one can place a value on what each and every school in our district provides our children: A quality education. We urge the board to fully consider the impact of disrupting the entire school community. All our children require and deserve stability, continuity, especially in these times.

Mrs. Laverdure stated that the district would not be divided as long as she is superintendent. We respectfully ask the board to follow that lead and find other means of bridging the budget gap besides deciding between one of the two schools.

Transparency is a way of protecting fairness and ensuring the common good. We implore the board to add additional dates for public hearings to the calendar within the 90-day consideration period, but understand that 90 days is not a lot time to make this decision.

Things for you to consider: Next year's proposed budget includes 8.3 million dollars for supplies.

A 20 percent reduction would save 1.6 million dollars.

Last year's finances reflect a general fund balance of 8.8 million dollars. Assigning 20 percent of that for next year's budget appropriation would provide 1.7 million dollars.

Smithfield's renovation finances indicated they

were paid for with a bond issue of 30 million dollars, but 1 in the end cost only 16 million. Is the unspent 14 million 2 3 dollars also part of the debt we still carry in the district?

> VOICE: Three minutes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. POWER: Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 5, Chris Griffin.

MS. GRIFFIN: Hi. I come tonight as a resident, a taxpayer, and a proud parent of a former student. It's good to hear from the parents' comments that East Stroudsburg continues its tradition of excellence in education, of responsible relationships with their teachers and parents at home and the excellent programs in sports, extracurriculars, arts and music. So, thank you all for your commitment to the community and doing a really great job. I know you're doing it and I'm really, really happy and proud to be a part of the district.

As a taxpayer who has no children in the system it's difficult to be facing the challenges that we are. I'm aware of the fact, though, that the bridge in funding is necessary because the State has cut 550 million dollars to the county, if I'm not incorrect, and that is why, despite the fact that we have been promised real estate tax relief, we are facing this increase in taxes. So, I do not blame the district. I realize the problem comes from

Harrisburg.

If there's one place to cut I would suggest the newsletter. It's got to be a really big expense to put that all together and as much as I appreciate it as a resident, seeing what's happening in the schools, as important as this information is, I really would ask the press under the circumstances to try to pick up the slack. Dave Pierce probably wouldn't mind writing a few more excellent stories and with what the municipalities and the districts are paying in just the public notice fees I think we could get much better coverage. It would be healthy and positive to read that in the Pocono Record instead of the crime sheet.

Moving on to the closure of schools, I'd just like to say that although everybody likes a walkable community and everyone's afraid of urban blight I feel really, really confident based on the projects that we're seeing before Smithfield, and I am a township supervisor, that there are many, many, many business opportunities for adaptive reuse of the J.M. Hill school. I have no prejudice between Smithfield and J.M. Hill. I know they're both excellent schools. However, with the 3 million dollars in grant funding that it is my understanding that the district has obtained, those funds could perhaps be used towards adaptive reuse and sale of the J.M. Hill school to many,

many entities who are anxious for mixed use residential and retail, for old folks homes. There are many facilities right there at J.M. Hill that would create an ideal situation for a developer versus the expense of bringing a plan and stormwater and engineering to a township like Smithfield. There are a lot of advantages to strategic adaptive reuse of the existing structure and I'd really like us to look at the sale of that building and what that could do to our overall debt because we could pay down capital and maybe look at debt restructuring. That would be an excellent scenario in my mind.

For the parents who are concerned about urban blight, we all know that East Stroudsburg is a really great place for lots of people to live and work. What the existing structure offers is tremendous existing infrastructure, walkability, public transportation, a recreational spot, and many other advantages which I would be happy to speak to the board about separately or write you a letter.

Thank you so much for your consideration. I know you're all doing a great job.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 6, Rose Ann Whitesell.

MS. WHITESELL: Resident, taxpayer, Smithfield Township, Shawnee Village, and a former teacher. Tonight I

am here to ask the school board to please keep our schools open. Closing a school is devastating to a community. Children are uprooted from their friends and their teachers. Jobs are lost and property values go down. These changes will force some citizens to leave our area and lessen the amount of taxpayers.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Closing a school does not lower taxes. It can actually lead to an increase.

Many people have moved to our area because of our small community schools. J.M. Hill and Smithfield are two excellent schools with a history of top test scores. Closing either of these schools will impact all of the students in this district. Class size will increase and special programs such as speech, gifted, and reading support will be pushed out into the hallways. Our district had to instruct students in the hallways and in portable classrooms for too long. It took years to give our children the classrooms they deserved. Taxpayers do not want to see this happen again. If this board does close a school I hope that you will consider the fact that taxpayers have already spent millions of dollars renovating Smithfield. If you keep Smithfield open you will save more jobs from being lost. Unfortunately, J.M. Hill still needs millions of dollars in renovations and it does not make sense to put the money into it even at a good interest rate if you are going to close

the school.

I hope that you will keep both schools open and look at other options to close the budget gap. Closing a school is not worth the high price our children and community will have to pay. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 7, Mr. Mahar.

MR. MAHAR: Yes. Ernest Mahar. I'm a resident and taxpayer residing at 12 Lions Street in East Stroudsburg.

I've been a resident of this area for over 10 years and currently have a daughter attending second grade at J.M. Hill Elementary. I very much appreciate the opportunity to address you tonight.

I want to state that I was born in Pontiac, Michigan, and I spent the first 40-something years of my life in metropolitan Detroit, so I think I have a little bit of firsthand knowledge about the subject of declining neighbors. The point I would like to make regarding the potential closing of the J.M. Hill Elementary property specifically is one that goes outside of the justifiably emotional issues of small class size, the quality of education for children or the advantages of a small school versus the alternative, all of which are of vital importance and I'm sure will be well addressed this evening.

I would like to address the subject of

community and neighborhood preservation. The area immediately surrounding J.M. Hill is defined almost exclusively by the presence of it, as the only distinguishing institution in the neighborhood. As it is the single defining presence, the school represents not only the identifying characteristic of the neighborhood, but the social and cultural hub as well.

By shuttering this facility, the board would put the entire neighborhood into a path escalating decline not only due to its loss of identity, but also by virtue of the landscape becoming dominated by a vacant and most assuredly declining physical edifice.

The irreplaceable loss of tax revenues due to inevitably declining property values, the potential for vandalism on the property, the subsequent overall decline of the neighborhood and the inescapable loss of residents due to these factors will be, in my estimation, much more detrimental to the future of the borough, the district, and the area than the temporary easing of roughly 10 percent of the school board's current budget deficit.

I urge the board to look beyond the short term, stop gap budget Band-Aid of the potential closure of the district's highest performing institution and to keep J.M. Hill Elementary and its adjoining neighborhood viable and a contributing influence in the best interests of all East

Stroudsburg Area School District residents.

Again, thank you for your time and God help you with this difficult issue.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 8, Scott Amori.

MR. AMORI: Good evening. My name is Scott

Amori. I am a resident, a taxpayer, and parent in the East

Stroudsburg School District. My children attend Smithfield

Elementary.

East Stroudsburg Area School District now stands facing the fiscal tidal wave that has been building for 20 years. I, along with the subsequent speakers, formed a joint effort we call Save Our East Stroudsburg Schools and commenced a review of the district's structure, the 126 million dollar budget from last year, the professional contract, and the school code.

This district faces a 10 million dollar massive shortfall for 2012-2013. The proposed preliminary budget includes yet one more tax increase, this time 5.8 percent which simply cannot be sustained.

We selected one school not subject to this hearing to review your enrollment numbers. We found that the enrollment figures failed to match across the different district computer systems -- 697 students versus 730 students. Absent a proper census of students, the district's starting point, frankly, is fatally flawed.

We examined the alleged savings by closing these two buildings. Buried in the District's numbers is the startling fact that the estimated yearly expense to operate each building was only \$50,000.00, less than one half of one percent of the proposed budget deficit.

We looked at the district's estimated staff savings that you presented here tonight and we chose three single instructor positions that would have to be eliminated contractually and so forth under the collective bargaining agreement. Frankly, the district's numbers overstate the savings by \$26,000.00 for those three positions alone.

Assessment for this -- challenges in Pike
County and Monroe County because of our declining real
estate valuations continue. This board approved a
settlement with Pocmont recently which carved 1.45 million
dollars from the tax assessable base from this school
district. Fernwood is in litigation. Can't be far behind.

Additionally, this district's debt service which you listed tonight at 18 million dollars, on last year's budget was 19 million dollars, this is an albatross around this district and this taxpayer's neck. It doesn't disappear. The debt service doesn't disappear if you close one school, both schools or, frankly, all of the schools. It makes no difference. We are stuck with it as taxpayers.

The proposal also really makes no mention of

the impact of closing the school recently renovated by state aid.

Absent in this discussion? The 43 million dollar non-instructional staff budget and any cuts there. Additionally, personnel. These personnel costs alone comprise 62 percent of your operating budget of the non-instructional budget line items.

For the sake of the students, for the sake of the taxpayers and residents, this board should, frankly, undertake a comprehensive budget review by a qualified professional rather than rushing through this fatally flawed school closure plan. If you want volunteers, we'll help. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 9, Sean Boyer.

MR. BOYER: Good evening. I reside at 152

Gabriel Estates in East Stroudsburg and I'm a resident and taxpayer. Thank you for your time. I applaud the efforts in finding creative ways in your February 27th budget meeting to save 6.5 million dollars. I don't understand why you didn't go over that tonight at all, but thank you.

Creative methods may help to find the rest of the needed funds such as the following: One, having administrative staff pay half their health insurance like a lot of us already do. Cut the Driver's Education program. Rent out school rooms to adult night classes. Having

parents buy school books. Having businesses advertise on school buses. As you heard at the February 13th meeting, we all have to make sacrifices.

The approach that was taken by the board in communicating the school closings was not in the best interests of the community as it did not provide enough time for us to organize and research. If some of the budget cuts listed in the February 27th budget meeting were determined and decided upon within the past two weeks, just think what could have been done if this had been formally brought to the public a year ago.

public and civil problems. They did a study last year concluding that informing the public early on in the process of closing schools will result in a much fairer process for everyone involved, school closing or not. The district's site had given one year advance notice to the public [sic].

In the past two weeks several groups have organized in our district participating in solving the problem as a community. We, as a community, have found discrepancies as Mr. Amori pointed out, found solutions, and have educated our ourselves as to the nature of our problem. Let me underscore our problem as this affects the entire district.

On Monday I sent direct questions to the

district Right To Know officer trying to find numerical trends over the past five years trying to figure out what went wrong, where we are headed, and what could be done. I received a bunch of links yesterday afternoon which might provide me some of the data, but I have to sift and compile it myself which I had no time for last night. Again, we should have been given more time to educate ourselves and determine solutions.

Lastly, while there was just cause to build a new elementary school based upon the influx of new students, the decision to build a 40 million dollar school instead of a typical 10 to 20 million dollar school has proven to be severely underestimated, compounding that with the redistricting of hundreds of students and transferring them from the very two schools we are now discussing to be closed. There's no doubt that poor decisions have been made in the past. Let's not make another poor decision when we're dealing with the welfare of our kids, our educators and our communities. With such a devastating impact to our community, this is not the time or circumstance to rush to judgment of closing a school. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 10, Christopher Brooks.

DR. BROOKS: Good evening. My name is

Dr. Christopher Brooks. Taxpayer, resident. Kiwanis

Street, East Stroudsburg.

My colleague, Dr. Eileen (inaudible), and I represent differing ethnic groups, political affiliations, and schools within the district, but in the spirit of bipartisanism and the spirit of (inaudible), which has been severely harmed both locally and nationally, we wish to share with you why we both find that East Stroudsburg Area School District's proposal to close either J.M. Hill or Smithfield Elementary troubling given recent research demonstrating a lack of financial benefits from school closures.

A recent Pew study indicates significant savings from school closures occurs only if accompanied by faculty layoffs. As many of the teachers who work here live here, too, laying them off could force them to leave the county. This, in turn, decreases tax base, a vicious cycle of declining population and tax revenues.

This problem is exacerbated by the closure of neighborhood schools which serve to increase property values. A recent Urban Economic Journal study found that the school closures in Shaker Heights, Ohio, for example, led to a 9.9 percent decrease in home values.

Further, one of the advertised benefits of school closures is that buildings can be sold to private investors in order to yield income to municipalities. Many

studies indicate this alternative reuse is very rare.

Selling or leasing closed schools is, quote, extremely difficult and that unused schools, quote, attract vandalism and other illicit activity, unquote.

Community shuttered schools, therefore, incur more costs such as lost tax revenue, reduced property values, property damage, and the need for increased police patrols, an issue which I raised in the 13 February hearing.

Some community members argue that the teachers are overpaid and their contracts should be open to renegotiation. East Stroudsburg teacher salaries are not outrageously high. Look at the collective bargaining agreement. No one is earning close to the \$90,000.00 salary that some people are claiming. One avenue of savings might be their health care contributions, but even that has been subject to regular annual increases in the current CBA.

Discussion of administrators who have already taken a voluntary pay crease [sic] and making contributions was also discussed.

Closing schools may address the symptom of our economic malaise, but it would not end -- but it would end up worsening the high unemployment and a depressed housing market as well as reducing the quality of our children's education.

We urge this board to fulfill its 2006 adopted

Code of Conduct responsibility; engaging all community
stakeholders, taxpayers, by addressing shortfalls through
transparent dialogue with the community, one which is well
aware of the need for long-term fiscal responsibility.
We, the taxpayers, are here to work with you,
just ask. Respectfully submitted. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 11, Elizabeth

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 11, Elizabeth Kirkwood.

MS. KIRKWOOD: Hi. Elizabeth Kirkwood.

Taxpayer, resident and parent. 120 Worthington Avenue,
Shawnee, Pennsylvania.

Schools closures abound nationwide becoming almost epidemic. Our public educational problems are here to stay in this economy. In response we must be unified and strong and devise long-term creative solutions as a district, as a community, to protect our schools from closing year after year.

Why is this important? For one, the impacts of closing schools are very grave affecting everything from the real estate property values to the social fabric of a community.

And, secondly, because if we don't develop long-term strategies we'll see a domino effect whereby this school board will have to decide to close more schools every fiscal year and while it may seem like a wise decision to

close a school in the immediate short-term, make no mistake, the board will have to move mountains before it can reopen and close Smithfield or J.M. Hill in our district.

So, what can we do? First I want to commend you all as a district and a board on demonstrating the kind of critical creative thinking reducing the 10 million dollar deficit in the recent budget this past week. Line by line the district has identified ways to cut over 6 million dollars in its budget. Thank you.

To then jump to the conclusion that we should simply close Smithfield or J.M. Hill, it's an either/or story, pitting the schools against one another, to make up the remaining deficit gap, however, is both shortsighted and very destructive to our community. We simply have not had sufficient time to make such as drastic and Draconian decision. Rather, such a decision must be based on hard, empirical evidence that leads to a broadly supported, incontrovertible conclusion.

As a taxpayer and parent, I contend that we've not met this burden. Instead, I urge you, respectfully, as a board to implement the following measures designed to ensure sound reasoning, fairness, and transparency.

No. 1: Establish a Blue Ribbon, countywide advisory committee comprised of a balanced cross-section of the community.

No. 2: Continue to explore and alternative revenue streams in debt such as the state fund reserves.

And, No. 3, garner political support from state representatives.

A countywide advisory committee will provide the long-term guidance we need to address the systemic educational problems in our region. Moreover, this committee will serve to examine countywide strategies for fully understanding these numbers. They're just not clear. Reducing the deficit, establishing a realistic timeline, avoiding school closures, if possible, and proposing creative, long-term solutions to declining student populations and respective tax bases.

Volunteers to join this committee surround you here tonight. Let our voices be heard and let us together think creatively and explore options. Thank you very much.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 12, Geoff Gamble.

MR. GAMBLE: Thank you. My name is Geoff

Gamble. I am a taxpayer and resident of East Stroudsburg,

92 Fawn Road.

I'd like to ask, if I could, if everybody in the auditorium, if you're comfortable, could please stand as part of my presentation.

Ladies and Gentlemen, we've heard a lot about numbers tonight and rightfully so. The budget is vitally

important. The shortfalls are daunting. We've seen the numbers. These are the people. These people standing represent the students who will be most affected by your decision. Based on the numbers that I saw for attendance tonight this -- these people standing would represent one of the possible two schools. These are the people that will try to find a way to fit into their new school communities. They will be welcomed with open arms, there's no doubt, but it will be very different from what they have always known. These are the people who will have to adjust to the changes.

We've all seen what it's like for a new student to move into a school and we all know the challenges that they face and how intimidating it all can be. So, multiple that by 337 or 388.

These children will be anxious. They will be nervous. It may be very hard for them to focus on their studies as they work to adjust, I know. My daughter told me when she was moved from J.M. Hill to ESE. She still remembers Mrs. DeHart; she remembers and she misses. She loves ESE now, she's connected to it, but those connections, like all good things, took time to grow and wrap themselves around her. ESE is her school and she's produced to call it her home now. She knew what teacher she was hoping to get in the fifth grade when she was in the third grade. She knew. The children and parents of J.M. Hill and Smithfield

can tell you as well: They know their schools, teachers, and staff. Generations of the same family have been taught by the same teacher. They know. That's what makes the school a home.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Each school in our district is their neighborhood's small school. Each has forged these connections with their communities and, make no mistake about it, ladies and gentlemen, each of them will be affected by these proposals. Some will change by welcoming new students, but the changes won't stop there. Teacher and support staff cuts and furloughs will most certainly cause changes in the staff and classrooms of all school communities across the district, not just at Smithfield or J.M. Hill. Long-standing members of school communities at Bushkill, Resica, Middle Smithfield, and ESE may well move to a new school. Some, sadly, we may lose. We can hope that their talents and care for the children will still be there when we're ready to call them back, but like anyone who has lost their job, sometimes they cannot ride out the storm and must seek new harbors.

Change will come to all school communities if these options are executed by the board. We know that closing one or both of these schools will not lower anyone's taxes nor will it provide the long-term solutions to our financial problems.

1 VOICE: Time. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 13, Peter Kirkwood.

MR. KIRKWOOD: Ladies and Gentlemen of the board, friends and neighbors, hello. I am Pete Kirkwood. I'm a taxpayer. I live in the Village of Shawnee. I went to Smithfield. All four of my siblings did, too. My daughter's there now in kindergarten and so is my nephew. I won't belabor this point because I know that others have and will make it forcefully. Suffice to say that my family and I hold a deep affection for our alma mater and a strong feeling that it's central to our community.

I want to use an analogy to make my point, so please bear with me if it takes a moment for my meaning to become clear. Many of you are familiar with the ravages of diabetes and how, under certain circumstances, foot lesions sometimes necessitate an amputation. Many of you are also aware that successful control of diabetes requires a combination of expensive drug therapies and serious lifestyle modifications.

Now let's imagine our school district is the diabetes patient. The patient's definitely sick. Now let's imagine you, our school board, as the good doctor trying to develop a successful treatment. Let's imagine Smithfield school as the left foot and let's imagine J.M. Hill as the right foot. So far the feet themselves are healthy and no

one would advocate preemptively amputating a health limb to avoid complications from diabetes. Amputation doesn't cure the disease anyway, it just diminishes the patient.

If we are here to decide which of these schools to close, however, we are, in effect, deciding which healthy foot to chop off. This, of course, is missing the point. The underlying disease is that our school system costs more to run than we can raise to run it. Under that commitment to systemwide reform, closing one of these schools does nothing but retard our community's inevitable slide into convalescence. Pretty soon we'll be on the operating table again with another limb under the knife.

We shouldn't be debating which foot to sever, we should be attempting to articulate a vision for a real, sustainable vitality for the entire system.

Unfortunately, the treatment is complicated.

It's a commitment. It requires some pain all around and a real change of lifestyle and it can't be articulated in a three minute sound bite. One thing is clear, however. It needs to address the entire patient, not just one foot or the other.

Therefore, I support the formation of a Blue
Ribbon committee to examine this problem at the county
level, to consider the entire patient, and to proscribe a
holistic plan for the long-term health of our school system

and I call upon you, the school board, to request that the county commissioners form such a committee and that you postpone any decision on the closing of any school until this committee has met, done its research, and made its prescription. Thank you very much.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 14, Richard Berkowitz.

MR. BERKOWITZ: Richard Berkowitz. I'm a resident and taxpayer in the East Stroudsburg School District. I thought about writing a long speech and I know there are so many stories to be told. My kids no longer go to Smithfield, they go to East Stroudsburg Elementary. They were moved from that school a while back and I think there's great things to be said about all the schools.

I think it's an excellent thing that folks are now talking about creating committees and working with the school board. For the last three years I was at almost all school board meetings except for this year. I've been -- your meetings are the same night that I have another meeting, so I have missed probably the last eight meetings, regularly scheduled school board meetings, but I don't see too many people here that have been at those meetings. Some have become board members now that were at the meetings all the time and I think it's a great idea that we all kind of pitch in and rededicate ourselves to coming to those

meetings because it's a really difficulty job. I don't know how you even figure out the budget. At times I wonder do we even do that because it's so difficult to -- I mean, the reams of paper that I saw you guys working through tell me that it's almost -- it's a daunting task.

Whether or not we should keep a school or close a school I have no idea. I don't believe we have as a community, or maybe even as a board, enough information to really make that determination and my encouragement as well is that we, as a community, that the three hundred and some odd people that came out make a regular effort to meet with the board to get real information that we can use to help make decisions.

The taxes have gone up every year. I've lived here for 12 years, 10 years my current home. My taxes are double. There has been no change in the yearly having to double the taxes. I really do believe that -- and I don't know if it's county level or state level, but we need to consider action for the state for the proper funding of our school districts and that is a countywide decision, but, really, we have to focus on East Stroudsburg and we have to focus on what are our opportunities to correct that injustice.

I also do think that, again, there hasn't been enough information. I'd like to know more about what money

are we going to lose from the state by closing this school, what is the real rental income, and there's a million other questions.

So, I'm hoping that you guys have gotten those answers and I would also encourage that you get those pieces of information out to the public. Obviously, there must have been a fire or something else more important because the news packed up their bags and left and that's unfortunate because there's many people that can't come to these meetings for real reasons and so they won't have the information.

I hope that we as a community that's out here today will make -- I'll do it myself as well, make a continued effort to get to more board meetings to be an aid to you in solving this solution long-term, not short-term. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 15, Robert Wilson.

MR. WILSON: Hello. Bob Wilson, 128

Schoolhouse Road, East Stroudsburg. Resident, taxpayer,
teacher. First of all, I'd like to apologize to some of the
bigger elementary schools. I know how good those schools
are. You have to understand that some people are very, very
passionate and if you were in this position, if you were
from ESE, if you were from Bushkill you'd be fighting as
hard as you could and sometimes people say things that they

really don't mean and all of our schools are great and I'd like to say I'm sorry if anybody took anything anyone said wrong.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The other thing is that this timeline is so short. You've got to understand: If they go by this timeline your children will not know where they're going to go school when school ends. The teachers will not know where they're going to teach when the last day of school is. You're not going to know your bus runs. They're not going to know who they'll be with. This is not going to be made until the middle of summer. When your kids leave they might be saving good-bye to their friends for the last time. They might not even be in that same school. They might be saying good-bye to their teachers, their special teachers. This will affect every school. The highest paid teachers are not going to be let go. It's going to be the lowest on the totem pole. When they furlough, because of our contract the highest paid teachers with the most tenure are going to stay and the new teachers making bear minimum are the ones that are going to go. You have to understand that also.

It's just such a crunch in time. If we could just have more time to think this over and all this input from all these people. It just seems like we're rushing into it. And, at the last meeting we had one of the board members told me that we were in a minority. Well, we've had

like 14 people here. Where are the people that want these buildings closed? Are they going to speak next? Please come up if you want to speak. I'm sure you're registered. Correct? So, if they're going to speak I'm going to stick around and listen to the people that want the buildings closed. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: At this time we're going to take a five minute break. When we come back we'd like speakers 16 through 30, if we could.

(Recess from 8:09 p.m. to 8:17 p.m.)

MR. DIRVONAS: We only have 16 or 17 remaining, so if we could have the rest of the speakers come up front and maybe sit in the second row what we'll try to do is try to get this finished up rather than have an additional recess. Thank you.

If we can have Speaker No. 16, Susan Jorstad.

MS. JORSTAD: As a parent -- I'm sorry.

Susan Jorstad, 3194 Dogwood Terrace, East Stroudsburg.

Resident, taxpayer, and mother of four children in the district.

As a parent I am concerned about the quality of education for my children. We have good teachers, good families, had the opportunity for a good education at every one of our schools. So, this is not a matter of my child's school is better than any other school.

As a taxpayer, I am concerned that the decision to close the school is being made hastily based on miscalculations and without regard for the whole picture.

In reviewing the budget proposals and proposed spending cuts

a number of areas still need to be addressed.

One: Why does the cost savings analysis for closing Smithfield include furloughing 10 professionals while closing J.M. Hill, which is a larger school in terms of enrollment, would result in furloughing only six professionals? The difference in savings between the two options appears to be entirely the difference in the number of teachers you would chose to furlough under either option, so why would 10 be furloughed under either option?

No. 2: Smithfield houses Early Intervention and Autistic Support students through the IU as well as Life Skill students, but I don't see these numbers included in the table that compares enrollment in each of our elementary schools. If Smithfield were to close where would the students go?

No. 3: Cost savings of closing Smithfield versus J.M. Hill is unfair and incomplete. Smithfield is fully up to date having just four years ago undergone a multi-million dollar renovation. The renovations in excess of 2.5 million being planned for J.M. Hill are not necessarily included in that cost comparison and I'm

7

14

15

16

8

9

17 18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

wondering why not. Perhaps your answer would be that the J.M. Hill renovation must be done even if that school should remain vacant, but why renovate a vacant building that the board admits has a low likelihood of being rented? Why not do minimal repairs to keep the building standing in case of a future need or sell or demolish the building? Why aren't these alternatives being discussed?

No. 4. If Smithfield is to be closed will we be required to repay state subsides received for the recent construction and renovation at a higher interest rate since the building's no longer being used for educational purposes? This also needs to be part of the comparison if you're considering closing one of the schools.

No. 5. Based on the board's budget, six million of the 10 million dollar shortfall for 2012-13 is due to an increase in salaries and benefits. This 6 million dollar increase over the prior year includes two and a half million dollars, additional taxpayer dollars, for teacher pensions and an additional 1.8 million for medical insurance. One of my questions is why the administrators are not contributing to their health care premiums. This would be one place to start in terms of balancing that overall budget. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 17, Wendy Sheeran.

MS. SHEERAN: Wendy Sheeran, 116 West Broad

Street, East Stroudsburg. Taxpayer and resident. Make no mistake, your taxes are going to increase whether we close both of the schools or not. Just as important is what will happen to our community with empty schools. What will happen to our kids as they try to adjust and more buildings close with our growing deficit.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

As a 7th grader, my district consolidated schools and sent the 7th and 8th grades from my town to the neighboring junior high within the district. Children are innocent and I, like my friends, would have gone innocently with an open mind to Ford City Junior High. However, because of parents, taxpayers who sat in meetings like these for months and bashed Ford City, talked about the bad apples there, screamed at board members and picketed in front of their homes for weeks I went to junior high inherently afraid of the bad apples and overtly sad that the school my family so much loved didn't matter enough to nine people with power. It came down to my mind that it should have been more than that. I felt that I had failed somehow and I see that happening here. At J.M. Hill I am, unfortunately, seeing the same behavior starting to emerge; angry parents yelling, holding signs, and promoting conspiracy theories that affect our kids in both schools. Like in my hometown, divisiveness will end up equaling failure here, too. And it didn't save money. The schools separated again and have

stayed that way, but the raw emotion, the senseless furry
that ran rampant in the hearings and news articles that came
out in school changed our community forever.

My message to parents, taxpayers, and the board is this: If we unite in our purpose, we will stand. If we divide, we will fall one after the other. Let's go to our representatives and ask them in unison to fight for us instead of fighting amongst ourselves. Let's work together in a Blue Ribbon commission to help these elect officials do what we want them to do and do what needs to be done: Save money and keep smaller class size in community schools.

As the Reverend Martin Niemoller once said,
"When the Nazis first they came for the communists I
remained silent. I was not a communist. When they locked
up the social democrats I remained silent. I was not a
social democrat. When they came for the trade unionist I
did not speak out. I was not a trade unionist. When they
came for the Jews I remained silent. I was not a Jew.
When they came for me there was no one left to speak out.
Who will speak for the other schools in our district if we
refuse to solve this together? Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 19, Steven Zimmerman.

MR. ZIMMERMAN: My name is Steve Zimmerman.

I'm a 30 year resident of East Stroudsburg. I first want to

say thank you for your services. You're put in an extreme situation.

This is only the second time I've spoke or had the opportunity to speak to the board. I wish to say I represent the people who aren't as affluent as others.

Taxes are at an all-time high and they're not really going to go away for the next four or five years. When we look at Pennsylvania revenue, it's posted on the website, and the corporation tax, year to date, was 1.2 billion. It sounds like a lot, but, truthfully, the Commonwealth is in much of a problem as we are considering they had a 260 million dollar short fall or 17 percent, 18 percent. So, they're in the same boat we are. You only get so much money with so much to do with it.

I don't think the governor's going to help you. I really don't think your representatives are going to help you. Some have come up with a great idea, the great idea being that they have this HR1776 Property Tax Independence Act which was submitted. I only have six copies. I apologize. As I said, I'm not a well off person. But, it's something to consider for future. I'm sure now you have timelines, but basically what it says is to increase the state tax to 7 percent and tax some other things and reduce property taxes.

There are people who are stressed. There are

people who give people food. When we look at our high

school, 60 percent are in the free lunch program or free

breakfast program. Kudos to all of you for allowing it to

stay open during the summer.

Rentals aren't going down. Taxes aren't going down. Like ourselves, we, too, as a family, we've had to cut. Maybe our cable, maybe take back a car, do other things. It's hard.

To pick a school is hard. J.M. Hill has been friends for my family for many years with all the teachers. Nine children. I say again, nine. Okay? And, every one of them is trying to be something in society that's gone beyond my house.

Maybe if you do have to close, maybe, and not to pick, but maybe Smithfield might be the one since you already bus. If you move J.M. Hill you have to rebus all these kids. Maybe Beacon School, Shawnee Academy and other students that you farm out to Lehigh Valley to teach, to train, and that cost, we maybe can do an alliance with Pleasant Valley, Stroudsburg, and others and maybe one of our schools could be that house and that alliance. It's certainly something worth looking into and that's really all that I have to say. Thank you again.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 20, Kathy Parrish.

MS. PARRISH: Hi. My name is Kathy Parrish.

227 Estate Drive, East Stroudsburg. I'm a taxpayer and a resident of East Stroudsburg. I'm also a parent of two sons who both attended J.M. Hill Elementary from kindergarten through fifth grade, so I do have a sentimental attachment to that school. I'm also aware, though, of the financial difficulties which we are facing as a district. We spent millions of dollars in recent years renovating, expanding, and upgrading Middle Smithfield and Smithfield elementary schools as well as building East Stroudsburg Elementary.

The projected enrollment for the 2012-13 school year for Middle Smithfield is 498 students in a building which has a capacity of 909 [sic]. Projected enrollment for Smithfield is 339 with a capacity of 638. Projected enrollment at ESE is 707 and has a capacity of 858. There's the potential for an additional 411 students at Middle Smithfield, 299 at Smithfield, and 151 at ESE. The projected enrollment for J.M. Hill is for only 393 students who could all be easily accommodated at the other three schools. There's also sufficient room to absorb any new students coming into the district.

It's fiscally irresponsible for this board to make plans for a 3 million dollar renovation to upgrade

J.M. Hill when there's a 10 million dollar budget deficit.

I understand that the district has secured a 2.5 million dollar bond, but I cannot believe that there's not a

contingency plan to return money that's not needed. The district but on its website what the savings would be if either J.M. Hill or Smithfield Elementary would be closed, but the website did not incorporate the savings if the renovation is not done. If J.M. Hill is closed the money saved from salaries, benefits, operating cost, and renovation will result in a savings of over 4 million dollars.

J.M. Hill is a beautiful, historic building, but just as there were significant issues with the Bunnell building, the same holds true for the J.M. Hill building.

Although it would be an initial adjustment for the staff as well as the students and the families directly involved, the financial gain would have an affect on the educational system as a whole for the entire East Stroudsburg Area School District. With a 10 million dollar budget shortage, there's no reasonable rationalization for starting another costly renovation and take on more debt. History has proven that unexpected renovation costs tend to expand once a project has started resulting in higher than anticipated expenses. We have three newly built and renovated alternate sites where we can provide the J.M. Hill students with a modern technology, inclusive learning environment. The board will be short-sighted to reduce the emotional -- I'm sorry, the educational opportunities for

all the other students in this district, all the other eight schools, because of the sentiment offered for the 339 students at J.M. Hill. Considering the financial issues which the district is currently facing and will continue to face in the future it's time to make hard choices. It makes sense to close a school which requires significant and costly improvement: J.M. Hill. Smithfield Elementary has already had extensive improvements completed. The district should not put any financial burden on the taxpayers by taking on additional debt and we should close J.M. Hill school.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 21. Sapphire Serrano.

MS. SERRANO: Sapphire Serrano. 16 Oak Lane, East Stroudsburg, PA. Resident and taxpayer. Here's a fun fact. Today would have been Dr. Seuss's 103rd birthday, a quirky author who saw the value in developing the minds of our youth. Schools throughout the United States celebrated in his honor -- J.M. Hill was no different -- by wearing pajamas and engaging in Dr. Seuss's books. This morning as I dropped off my son and saw the number of students wearing PJs walking to school with such excitement written on their faces my heart smiled. There was a certain goodness emanating from our streets this morning, a goodness that would disappear with the closure of J.M. Hill and Smithfield

by potentially lowering property taxes, by negatively impacting our education with the increase of class sizes and the furloughing of teachers.

School board members, I urge you to research and any all avenues that would allow both J.M. Hill and Smithfield Elementary to stay open. I urge you to consider options such as pay-to-play sports, energy conservation, allow us parents to purchase school supplies, rent out school classrooms to other institutes, and, lastly, have administrators and teachers pay towards their health insurance.

Additionally, I would like to piggyback on the Save Our East Stroudsburg group about forming a Blue Ribbon committee.

I leave you with this. Think left and think right, think low and think high, all the things you can think up if you only you try. Thank you for your time.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 22, Kerrie Curtis.

MS. CURTIS: Hello. Kerrie Curtis. 516 Oak
Street, East Stroudsburg Borough. Resident, taxpayer,
mother of two children.

Let me just start out by saying I do not envy any of you guys your position tonight. This is such a difficult decision laid upon you guys and I would not want to be in your position right now.

schools.

My children do not attend the East Stroudsburg Area School District because it is our local public school, they attend East Stroudsburg because it is the best schools in the area. I checked the AYP reports, I checked class sizes, I actually wanted to send my kids to private school. Talked to parents in the district. I was told how great J.M. Hill teachers are, how great Smithfield's teachers are, how active the principals are. Turns out it's actually better than private schools; they're getting a better education. It's a smaller class size than the private

This is a small, tightknit community. We have six small, tightknit community elementary schools. They gives the kids a sense of pride in their community. It gives the kids a sense of belonging to their community. They go to school where their neighbors went to school. They go to school where their relatives went to school. It gives them pride. These are the children that are going to be leading us in the future. We want them to have pride in our community. We want them to lead us into the next decade, century, what have you with that strong community feeling to prevent problems like this happening in the future.

The staff at these small schools from the principal down to the support staff know the children by

name. They call them by name in the hallways. That gives the children such a sense of pride and accomplishment. They look forward to going to school every day because everybody knows their name.

It was mentioned before that the class sizes would be 22 to 23 children if J.M. Hill were to close. Right now my daughter is in a class with 24 children so how will class sizes actually decrease by adding 100, 200 students to another school?

Finally, I know that the board will make the proper decision. We're doing our best to help find the cuts and I'm sure the board can look a little bit deeper, find places to cut. Allow us to purchase the supplies for our children for school. Take it off the board's hands. Let us pay to play. Let us help you save our schools. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 23, Carrie Panepinto.

MS. PANEPINTO: Hello. Carrie Panepinto.

244 Braeside Avenue. I'm a taxpayer and resident. I've lived here for nine years. I have three children attending J.M. Hill. I have two more still to come, so that would be five children. I have three that are in kindergarten, first, and second grade. I will be a part of J.M. Hill for 13 years when all is done. I thought about moving, but I don't want my children to lose out on the J.M. Hill

experience.

My kids were actually very upset that school closed on Wednesday because, as the last few speakers said, we had Dr. Seuss week and Wednesday was Whacky Wednesday. So, they kept asking when they were going to dress up for Whacky Wednesday. They were upset about not going to school. That just blew my mind. I'm also a teacher at High School North, so I enjoyed my snow day.

My kids also have prizes that they can get because we have a Pride program at our school and my students, my kids, choose to spend time with the principal as opposed to getting a little prize, a little toy. They want to spend time with the principal and see what she does or spend time with the computer coach so that they can play on the computers and learn more and they're very excited to come home and talk about it with me and with my younger kids. My two year old is so excited to go on the school bus and go to J.M. Hill. Of course, he has three years until then, but he can't wait to go.

J.M. Hill is a community and I stress
community. It's a family. My kids love going there as I
have said many times. It's also a successful school.

95 percent meet AYP. That's huge. 95 percent are
proficient.

It's a growing school. Since my daughter

started in kindergarten to now there's 50 additional students in the school and I'm also a PTO president, so I'm very involved in raising funds for the school and I have an active PTO involved in our family game nights and our fundraisers we do and all the activities we do. Our school is so close we know everyone, we talk to everyone. As I said, the support staff knows their names. My kid is so excited when they come home and someone said their name. Everyone knows my children and they're only in kindergarten, first, and second grade. And they're good kids. That's one of the reasons; they're good kids.

But, there's a lot of factors to be considered when thinking about the budget. Right now we're trying to do the budget and we're trying to think about closing schools. There's too much going on. We need more time to decide on what we need to do for this budget and the schools. It's rushing something that could be detrimental to the future of our district.

Remember, it's about the kids, it's about our future. J.M. Hill is a community school. So many kids are saying, "My parents went here. My grandparents went there," and they stayed here so they could bring their children and their families to J.M. Hill. They didn't want to move. Like, I don't want to move because I want my kids to continue at J.M. Hill. It's a community just like

Smithfield is. This is a community that we don't want to break up and cause more problems in the future.

б

So, please remember it's for the children.

We are educating our children and our future. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker 24, Cathy Gallagher.

MS. GALLAGHER: Cathy Gallagher. 186 State

Street, East Stroudsburg. I'm a resident, a taxpayer. I

was born here, grew up here, live here, and I now work for

J.M. Hill. When I started out I worked at a bigger

elementary school. It was sometimes so big it was a little

chaotic at times. I never once met the principal in the

whole four months I worked there. As soon as the opening

came up I jumped at the chance to work at J.M. Hill.

Everyone there knows everyone and the principal is very

visible and knows all of us personally by name. From

Mrs. Arnold to all the teachers, support staff, my fellow

cafeteria workers, and the custodians, which one happens to

be my oldest son, we're all like one big extended family.

My youngest son is at JTL this year and thanks to his great teachers there on the Oak team and, more importantly, the teachers at J.M. Hill who gave him the tools needed to move up he is a High Honor student.

I could say I really, really need my job, but it's really -- what I'm saying is I love my job. I have been a PTO board member for four years and everyone,

students, parents, staff, Mrs. Arnold, everybody worked together at every event would do to make our school a success and I think it's very important.

б

So, please, forget numbers and think bodily. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 25, Gerard Rozea.

Is that correct?

MR. ROZEA: Rozea, yes. Thank you. My name is Gerard Rozea, 309 Reagan Drive, a resident, a taxpayer in Smithfield Township.

First I'd like to thank the board for the opportunity to discuss a very serious matter of possible closure of either J.M. Hill or Smithfield Elementary. My daughter is a first grader in Smithfield Elementary school. Our experiences with the school, administration, staff and teachers has been beyond anything I could have hoped for.

The student center, the learning environment has allowed my daughter to excel academically, emotionally, and socially. She loves her teachers, classmates, and has found a true enjoyment in her education and in school.

Please take the time to consider all options before making this important decision. Not based on short-term budget needs, but consider the potential long-term effects of the education of the students. Please do not close our schools. The school district should consider that

the short-term cost savings in closing the schools outweighs the long-term affects on education opportunities and the affect this has on all the schools in the district considering the fact if redistricting occurs and how that impacts all of the schools. It appears enrollment numbers for Smithfield Elementary School and J.M. Hill can be attributed to redistricting when East Stroudsburg Elementary School was open. Taking nothing away from any of the schools, but this must be considered in enrollment totals and impacts on all the schools as we move forward. The deficits next year in the budget are expected to exceed those for this year. Please consider the long-term budget strategy and affect school closures may have on them. Significant increases in taxes are likely to occur with or without the closure of the schools. Therefore, the immediate budget should not outweigh the long-term educational and fiscal effects associated with this decision.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I encourage the board to identify creative ways to minimize cuts and to look at areas of potential savings and other revenue resources. The current allocation of funds from the state to the district should be addressed to ensure the proper funding formulas for the county. Address the state funding and work to educate individuals of problems of cutting public education and the need to restore

1 the funding. Look at other revenue sources. Other areas are facing similar problems and we should look to those 2 ideas and creative opportunities that have been created in 3 4 those areas. Identify ways to decrease expenses and 5 possibly generate revenue. Minimize unneeded expenses, usage and needs. Shift materials from where it's not being 6 7 used to where it's most needed. Energy saving ideas. Simple things like turning lights out, stop the drips, 8 9 thermostat regulation, reduction of paper, transition to 10 on-line technological resources. Cooperative ideas. 11 Cooperative purchasing working with multiple districts. 12 Consider strategic partnering. Other places are going 13 through similar problems. Consider other creative options. 14 Utilize --15 VOICE: Time. 16 MR. ROZEA: Thank you. 17 MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 26, Catharine 18 Berkowitz. 19 MS. BERKOWITZ: Hi. Catharine Berkowitz. I live at 6108 Franklin Hill Road in East Stroudsburg. I'm a 20 21 resident and taxpayer. First I'd like to thank the board and 22 23 administration for your time and, as far as the board, I 24 would also like to acknowledge the many, many hours you've

put in as a board member and volunteering your time.

25

I have a daughter in 7th grade at JTL and a son in fourth grade at ESE. I can empathize with the fears of the Smithfield and J.M. Hill parents. My daughter was at Smithfield through third grade and we loved the small school setting and had some wonderful teachers. I still think very fondly over her years there and the feeling of family they

provided.

When the redistricting happened I was very unhappy with the thought of my daughter having to switch schools and go to the big school on the hill. That being said, we have been very happy at ESE. Both of my children have flourished there. We've had wonderful teachers and a wonderful, nurturing experience. Also, because it is a bigger school there have been more after-school activities for them to be involved with. Many of the stories the parents are telling you today that they've experiencing at J.M. Hill and at Smithfield I experience now at ESE with my son. The teachers know him. It's just -- it's a great experience that we've been having.

So, if the school were to be closed I'd like to just reassure the parents of J.M. Hill or Smithfield students that it is not the absolute end of the world because I was terrified and it has been great.

If cuts do have to be made, and these cuts do have to be made, I hope that everyone considers what's next

on the list if we do not close either of the schools. I'm not saying that we should or shouldn't close the school, I'm just hoping that the financials are looked at closely and while people may be unhappy with the closing of a school, I believe that many of these people would be equally unhappy if things like after-school programs, AP classes or other programs or staffing that affect our children were cut. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 27, Sharon Maly-Cramer.

MS. MALY-CRAMER: Thank you. My name is Sharon Maly-Cramer. I'm an East Stroudsburg taxpayer and resident of 3108 Red Oak Lane, East Stroudsburg, PA.

I currently have a child attending Smithfield Elementary School and I come here before you, the Board of Directors, to ask that you not include closures in balancing the 2012-13 budget. I realize that our district faces the daunting task of closing a 10.2 million dollar deficit and it's going to require deep cuts, difficult decisions, yet I hope you consider, as our neighboring district did, that this action needs more time and investigation than the calendar will allow.

It is my understanding, as you concurred tonight, there are variables and figures that have yet to be finalized. I'm not sure how to address the possible savings

because the numbers don't seemed to add up and I question the stated savings comparing the two closures. I feel with further analysis of staff furloughs those numbers will be more comparable.

Aside from discussing the savings let us discuss the cost. I urge you to consider these carefully. A school is more than just a building, it is a community, and please don't dismiss student school pride, sense of community, and, most important, continuity. I feel this will compromise the educational standards of the East Stroudsburg Area School District.

And as for class size? It will raise my son, in any of the three proposals that were put forth, up to 27 students. Must I tell my third grader that he and his school is expendable? I hope not.

Let us work together and consider all other cost saving measures. And, there were good ideas brought forth today: Reducing supply costs, and work weeks for utility savings. I agree with the comment that was made at Monday's meeting that said pennies make dollars and I implore the board to scrape those together instead of consolidation, a word which many Americans now recognize as being synonomous with job loss, and in this case many of those jobs lost belong to our fellow community members.

It also means facility closure that scars the

landscape of the community creating a further decline in property values.

Now I feel I need to speak in defense of
Smithfield Elementary. Small should not equate to
insignificant yet this proposal makes us feel this way.
Enrollment capacity numbers don't tell the whole story.
There are IU20 classrooms not filled to capacity and it's
not empty as some have said. You chose to build a new one.
Sad, then, that it's being proposed that we not use it at
all. Over 16 million dollars in taxpayer money was used on
recent renovations of Smithfield. The district constructed
an impressive elementary school filled with upgrades that
increase the safety and educational experience of the
students. It would be a disservice to taxpayers and to the
school community to walk away from this facility.

I realize the need for fiscal responsibility, but school closures should be a last resort. I caution the board: The last time big decisions were made tied to projected enrollments in a hurry-now-approach we built the building. Please, don't consider this. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 28, Lynn Ames.

MS. AMES: My name is Lynn Ames. I'm a resident and taxpayer and I live on Roosevelt Road in East Stroudsburg. Dear School Board Members: Please let it go on record that I strongly oppose the closing of Smithfield

Elementary School. I have three children and all three of them have gone through the East Stroudsburg School District and they've all gone through Smithfield Elementary School as well as East Stroudsburg High School South.

We just remodeled the Smithfield Elementary
School and the taxes were increased to pay for this. A
subsidy, a state subsidy, to contribute to the expense was
signed and now the East Stroudsburg School District wants to
close this newly remodeled school.

It is said that enrollment is down. So, I'm a little confused as to why we built the new elementary school and we didn't have a little bit of foresight to see what was happening in the community. I feel as though it's a huge burden and a big mistake building that new elementary school in addition to the fact that the high school renovation was much too costly and many mistakes were made with that project as well. And, I'm not saying that the decisions were solely upon the board members, but I'm saying that, once again, planning was not done.

And who pays the price? The taxpayers. All of these decisions have ripple effects. People who look to move into our community will see it's a failing community if we close schools. Taxes are high and schools are closing. People can't sell their homes. Who can't afford to pay the high taxes? Senior citizens who have spent their entire

lives paying for their homes are now losing them because of taxes.

We should be thinking of creative ideas to bring in revenue, but instead we take, I feel, the lazy way out: We increase taxes.

I have a suggestion. Why don't we implement some ways to bring in revenue such as adult education? I heard Mr. Boyer already suggest that. I think it's a great suggestion. We could work with -- we have one of the greatest resources here, ESU. We could work with ESU and some of the newly graduated teachers from ESU, new teachers that can't otherwise find jobs and are anxious to work. Perhaps some interns from ESU would be interested in teaching classes such as exercise, nutrition classes, computer classes, et cetera.

We have ways to bring that money back into the school district and to stop increasing taxes. Perhaps some of the sports classes or driver's ed. should have a fee attached to them.

I come from the mindset that if you don't have the money to do something you either get something that costs less or you don't do it. It's time that East Stroudsburg Area School District did this.

Thank you for listening.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker 29, Richard Moran.

1
2 live
3 resid
4 the n

MR. MORAN: Good evening. Richard Moran. I live at 42 Skyview Circle in East Stroudsburg. I'm a resident and extreme taxpayer. Being I'm at the tail end of the night, a lot of my comments already were made. It's very clear about the buildings, the taxes. Everyone generally has the same concerns, so I'd like to come at it from a little different approach.

My feeling is that a school is the heart of the neighborhood. There's no two ways about it: Closing either of these schools is a loss of history, a sense of community and who we are and who our children are in this community.

The way this issue evolved and the way it was presented to the public was disturbing. It's caused a rift in the school district that benefits no one. The release of information and comments from the onset all seem to indicate that Smithfield is closing. Deal done, signed, delivered. If this is not reality, this is what I, as a taxpayer and a resident, got from everything that I saw and that needs to be presented to you so you're aware of what reality is. I believe that may still be the case.

I'd like to make a few points and I have a few questions that I feel the residents and taxpayers deserve as well as make you aware of my concerns. The first point which everyone has said and I'm not going to let it go is why is rehab work continuing at J.M. Hill. 3.3 million

dollar in debt. The credit card is full. Cut it up.

What -- 3.3 is the initial numbers. What will the final numbers be? You open the up the walls of a hundred year old school you'll find surprises and it's not full of money.

That's not meant to be funny.

The term interest-free grants has been thrown around numerous times. In my economic courses I was always taught about the opportunity cost of borrowed money because it is borrowed money. People get confused that a grant is free money. It's not, it's borrowed money. There's an opportunity cost associated with that money where it could be used to pay off higher interest debt which we have, I think, 110 million dollars worth. It could be used to invest in better programs. There's many, many things that could be done.

I almost feel that this closing discussion is a diversion, it's a diversion tactic to get us riled up against each other and then at the end you'll say, "We're not going to close it," and then everyone'll say "Yeah."

"Oh, by the way, we just cut 40 teachers." I have that concern and I think it's legitimate.

The elephant in the room is why is there so little talk about cutting salaries, pensions, and benefits? The free economy has spoken. That's what happens. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 30, Jennifer Marmo.

MR. MARMO: My name is Jennifer Marmo and I'm a resident of Pocono Ranchlands in Bushkill. I attended the meeting at JTL where the school board members voted on whether or not to hold this public hearing. That night ended a lot of parents' concerns about their children's schools. I understand that. However, I also heard a lot of ignorance regarding information that was available regarding the consolidation. East Stroudsburg Elementary isn't operating at full capacity. Therefore, if students go there from J.M. Hill or Smithfield there will not be 35 or 40 students in a classroom. Teachers will be moving with these students to fill empty classrooms.

I also heard a lot of negativity regarding other areas in the district, especially regarding larger schools and how principals or teachers don't know the children. My daughter is in kindergarten at Bushkill Elementary. During Teacher Night at McDonald's many teachers greeted her by name. Anytime I meet her teachers in the community they can always speak with me about her. My daughter is working on first grade sight words and math skills. Again, she's in kindergarten. She's also getting assistance with being left-handed in a right-handed world. So, in other words, she is known. She is getting enrichment and she is getting individualized attention.

5

7 8

6

10

9

11 12

13

14

15 16

> 17 18

19

20

22

21

23

25

24

We have to remember that our district covers two counties. We have to stop dividing ourselves into south and north, the haves and the have nots. We are one district with the same goal, to provide our children with the best possible education in these tough economic times.

I urge the board to make the decision that will be the best for the children in the whole district. you.

MR. DIRVONAS: Speaker No. 31, Josephine Ferro? Speaker No. 32 has withdrawn his request to speak.

Speaker No. 33 is Oscar Woerlein.

MR. WOERLEIN: My name is Oscar Woerlein. I'm a homeowner and taxpayer from Winona Lakes. I'm here just to speak off the cuff, I have nothing planned, and I think I represent the senior citizens here who have yet to speak tonight.

It's hard to formulate so many things, but I will start with the sitting board. All you individuals worked hard politically to be where you are and you need to make the right fiduciary, responsible decision. It takes time, I know, but whatever you decide the ramifications will go on for many years as we are now paying the cost from the last few years.

The situation right now is no matter what

occurs money is required. There isn't any. I personally had to eliminate my insurance, my vehicle, and the next thing is move out. It's that simple. Economics. We do what we have to do. We can't carry the weight.

The taxpayers of this area, as you can -- well, you should know, the home foreclosures are a mess. Your students aren't filling classrooms. Simple economics. Why carry an empty classroom? We have to consolidate. These are the things that will be before you. How you handle it, God only knows. I don't envy you.

whatever is done, as I said, is coming down to economics. The taxpayers, how much more can you squeeze out of them? And this goes for all, from the state and federal. It isn't there. So, if the economics call for you to close a school, whichever one, it's material, it has to be done. Salaries. The extra teachers. The good days or gone.

I can't interject anymore except if you do your job -- and I hear a lot of inaccuracies in the math that comes before us. I would think it'd be prudent for the board to have a forensic audit done and show the taxpayers what's going on. Besides what you're telling us we need reliable information and I believe you do, also. It would be for everyone's benefit.

So, consequently, I think I've ran my mouth off long enough. Thank you very much.

MR. DIRVONAS: The last registered speaker, No. 34, is Amanda Jackson.

MS. JACKSON: Hi. My name is Amanda Jackson.

I live at 423 Williams Street and I'm a 7th grade student at

JTL Intermediate. I'm here to represent J.M. Hill tonight.

I don't think you should close J.M. Hill because my brother

goes there and I would hate for him to switch schools.

Although I did not go to J.M. Hill, I went to a school in

New York that was closed and I had to switch to another

school and it was terrible and I would hate for young

children to have to switch schools like I did.

If J.M. Hill closes, he will lose his first school and his teachers. J.M. Hill is a good school and I -- a good learning environment. Although I'm only 12 years old, I know how important education is and how it feels to lose the school -- you lose your school and I don't want to see that happen again.

Also, the taxpayers just paid for a new parking lot at J.M. Hill, so it would be wrong to close J.M. Hill after many renovations were made because they would have been for nothing. Thank you.

MR. DIRVONAS: At this time I would like to once again mention that the board will be receiving written comments from the public for a period of three months from tonight's hearing and those comments should be submitted to

1 the board through either the superintendent or the board 2 secretary. Anyone wishing to submit those written comments, 3 again, should include their name, address, phone number, 4 and should sign the comments when they are submitted. 5 I would like to thank everybody for their participation tonight. I believe the speakers were all 6 7 excellent. I believe the public was a receptive audience 8 and I think that the board was a receptive audience, too. 9 We will be not only receiving additional 10 written comments and getting those out to the board, but the 11 board will also be seeking additional information. A lot of 12 that, I'm sure, as a result of the comments that were made 13 tonight. Mr. Searfass? 14 MR. SEARFOSS: I want to thank everyone who 15 come out. We do know that we are taking this decision very 16 seriously. We are not doing it lightly. We are taking it 17 very serious and considering many factors and, yes, money is one of them. 18 19 Thank you. Meeting is adjourned. 21 (Whereupon, the above concluded at 9:09 p.m. on

20

Friday, March 2, 2012.)

23

22

24

25

CERTIFICATION

I, Donna G. Kenderdine, R.P.R., do hereby certify that the foregoing was taken stenographically by me on March 2, 2012, and that this transcript is a true and correct transcript of the same, fully transcribed under my direction, to the best of my ability and skill.

I further certify that I am not a relative or employee of any of the parties in this action; that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney in this action; and that I am not financially interested in the event of this action.

Donna G. Kenderdine, R.P.R.

Notary Public